Volume 7, 2021, 102-108

# DURUSUL LUGHAH AL-ARABIYAH'S BOOK CONTENT: MACKEY'S PERSPECTIVE

Sopiah Institut Agama Islam Negeri Pekalongan, Indonesia

Khoifumina Yuniar Rajatni ២ Institut Agama Islam Negeri Pekalongan, Indonesia

Agus Riyadi Universitas Islam Negeri Walisongo, Indonesia

# Abstract

The purpose of this study was to determine the presentation of the material in the book *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* with the 2013 Curriculum of Madrasah Tsanawiyah Class VII by the Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia as teaching materials for Arabic language learning adapted to Mackey's perspective and to know the advantages and disadvantages of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book 2013 Curriculum Madrasah. Class VII Tsanawiyah. Useful to add to general knowledge, especially closely related to how to deliver. The research method used is library research with a qualitative approach. The results show that the book has met the criteria for a good textbook from Mackey's perspective: the selection in the material is quite good, the gradation in this material is coherent, the presentation in this material is very good, because it has used all four procedures, the repetition in the material is very good because there are practice questions. The strength of this *Durusul Lughah* book lies in the depth and breadth of the material. The shortcomings of this book lie in the indicators that are the same in all themes, it does not provide an index, glossary, and Arabic-Latin transliteration list, and the presentation of evaluation materials in this book is not appropriate.

Keywords: Textbooks, Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah, and Mackey

# Introduction

Textbooks are printed books that have the capacity of material or lesson components that are described in a structured manner so that students who study them can understand the content of the subject matter under the guidance of the teacher during the learning process (Izzuddin et al., 2021). The textbooks for educators and students in schools presented by the Ministry of Religion describe "living documents" (Kaba & Abdullah, 2020). So the books listed will always be updated and improved according to the needs and changing times (Moser, 2021). One of the textbooks used in Arabic lessons at the junior secondary and equivalent levels is *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* with the 2013 Curriculum of Madrasah Tsanawiyah Class VII by the Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia. Various junior high schools use the book as teaching material (Sa'adiyah & Saputra, 2018).

One of the factors in the development of Arabic textbooks that need to be observed in learning is the comprehension of the material. This makes it easier for teaching materials to be understood and understood by learners as users of the textbook, consisting of: logical decomposition, systematic presentation of material, there are examples and thematic pictures, aids to facilitate learning, neat and consistent formats, and accurate descriptions, interrelated and the benefits of textbooks (Ghani et al., 2021).

When the author examines the book *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah*, the scientific approach of the seventh grade 2013 curriculum by the Ministry of Religion (Anggota Kemenetrian Agama, 2014), if you look closely, this book looks very interesting because in each chapter there are illustrations or pictures related to each theme (Ubaid, 2020). Researchers found several irregularities, including sentences whose *kharakat* does not

match the rules of Arabic grammar (Salam, 2008). So that it will cause differences in meaning and meaning and will affect student understanding.

In addition, the author found several answers that were not in accordance with the question, questions that were not in accordance with the facts, and the use of inappropriate language rules (Maimunah & Irfandi, 2018). Because this book is used for students who come from different backgrounds, namely some students graduate from MI and some others graduate from elementary school who have never studied the field of Arabic language studies. So the textbook still needs to be reviewed in terms of material so that the book is worthy of being used as a learning resource.

Based on this analysis, the author is interested in studying more about the material content of the book *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyyah* Curriculum 2013 Madrasah Tsanawiyah Class VII based on Mackey's perspective. Mackey has his own view, on how to analyze a textbook material, including; material selection, sequencing, material presentation, and repetition of material (Ritonga, 2021). These four aspects are very appropriate to determine the quality and evaluate textbooks. Because the book plays an important role and really determines whether or not the implementation of learning is correct. If the material in the book contains many errors, then the knowledge and knowledge gained by students will deviate.

In the use and determination of textbooks in a lesson, the author wants to examine the book by adjusting Mackey's theory (Rosenberg, 1994). As in the Arabic language book which is used as a learning reference and student guide, according to the BSNP, the assessment of the book is in terms of the feasibility of the content or material, the feasibility of presentation, the feasibility of language, and the feasibility of graphics. These four elements become the quality of a quality book. So that it will have a good impact on the learning process and get maximum knowledge (Ceccherini-Silberstein et al., 2015). So the researcher explained two problem formulations, namely how to analyze the content of the book material *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* 2013 Curriculum Madrasah Tsanawiyah Class VII based on Mackey's perspective? What are the advantages and disadvantages of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book 2013 Curriculum Madrasah Tsanawiyah Class VII?.

#### Methods

The research conducted by the author in the preparation of this thesis is included in the type of library research. Library research is research using this method to obtain information data by placing existing facilities in the library such as books, papers, and documents. The researcher analyzed the book to collect data and information about the content analysis of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book 2013 curriculum at the seventh grade madrasah Tsanawiyah with a Mackey perspective compiled by the Ministry of Religion (Anggota Kemenetrian Agama, 2014). Research that uses descriptive qualitative. Qualitative research is an approach that is not numbers but in the form of words that produce descriptive data. In this study, the researcher uses this method to analyze the phenomena that occur in a study.

Data collection techniques are the most important step in research, because the main purpose of research is to obtain data. The data collection technique that will be used in the research here is the documentation method which is a method of collecting qualitative data by examining documents made by the subject himself or others about the subject related to the data needed by the researcher. The data includes articles, books, websites, and others.

The researcher summarizes the data carefully and in detail, to make it easier to examine the four criteria in the presentation of Arabic teaching materials proposed by William Francis Mackey including: selection, gradation, presentation, and repetition ("Language Teaching," 2007). With these four perspectives, Mackey aims to find out whether the contents of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book 2013 Curriculum Madrasah Tsanawiyah Class VII are appropriate. The assessment of the strengths and weaknesses of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book is based on the provisions of the National Education Standards Agency (BSNP) which are adjusted to the categories listed in the assessment instrument which include the feasibility of content, presentation, language and graphics. After the data is presented, the researcher draws a conclusion whether the data obtained by the researcher is in accordance with the problem formulation or vice versa.

# **Results and discussion**

Based on the results of the research on content analysis of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book in the 2013 curriculum for class VII with Mackey's perspective in determining the feasibility of textbooks (Anggota Kemenetrian Agama, 2014), there are four aspects that need to be considered, namely material selection, sequencing, presentation, and repetition. Meanwhile, to determine the advantages and disadvantages of the

2013 curriculum *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book with the BSNP (National Education Standards Agency) assessment instrument which consists of four components of the feasibility of the book, namely content feasibility, presentation feasibility, linguistic feasibility and graphic feasibility (Baroroh & Tsani, 2019). The following are the results of the analysis that the researchers obtained from the book *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* 2013 curriculum class VII:

# A Content Analysis of Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah's Book Based on Mackey's Perspective

#### 1. Material selection

The selection criteria are intended to filter and select language teaching materials using the criteria selection method used to select vocabulary, namely frequency, range, availability, coverage, and learnability. Based on the results of the analysis of the selection of vocabulary in the book *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* 2013 curriculum grade VII in terms of frequency (vocabulary that often appears) from the first theme to the seventh theme, there are several vocabularies that often appear or are still repeated in the material used presented in the book.

Furthermore, in terms of range (wide area of use of a word), it means a word that has no lexical meaning but has an important function in sentence structure. A word that is everywhere is more important than a word that is found in certain situations, even though the frequency is high (Shodiq, 2014). In the results of the analysis, there are several syllables that fall into the range. In *isim isyarah*, the vocabulary includes هذا، هذه، ذلك، تلك in *isim jer* there is في ، على in *isim dharaf* the vocabulary includes معذا، هذه، ذلك، تحت، وراء، بين in *isim dhamir* the vocabulary includes أنا، أنت، أنتِ، أنتِ، هو، هي in *isim dhamir* the vocabulary includes are معير، بعيد، قريب.

Next in terms of availability is the selection of an item or word that is very necessary and most appropriate for a particular situation. The repetition or use of the word is only in the chapter because it is so important and urgent that the word is repeated. The results of the analysis of this book in the context of *hiwar* (conversation), namely غرفة النوم and in the context of *qira'ah* (reading), namely بواب، المكتبة.

Furthermore, in terms of coverage, namely the ability of a word to include several meanings, in this book there is not a single word that includes several meanings. And finally, in terms of learnability, a vocabulary was chosen because it was easy to learn. The results of the analysis of this book are that there are several words that are easy to understand in the context of *hiwar*, including: كتاب، فصل، مسجد، and in the context of *qira'ah*, among others كرسى

#### 2. Sequencing

The material presented in this book has applied gradation. First, the grouping of the first semester material from chapter I to chapter IV and the second semester material from chapter V to chapter VII which have been arranged according to the four language skills, including listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Second, the order of the material in this chapter is arranged from easiest to hardest, from shortest to most complex. The vocabulary presented in this chapter is still relatively easy because some of the vocabulary is often repeated.

In the first semester. Chapter I with the theme التعريف بالنفس, which consists of 5 sub-themes including the first sub-theme of *mufradat* and its practice, the second sub-theme of *hiwar* and its practice, the third sub-theme of *tarkib* and its practice, the fourth sub-theme of *qira'ah* and its practice, the fifth sub-theme of the book and its exercises, and at the end there is التدريبات على الاستماع.

Next chapter II with the theme العاملون في المدرسة which consists of 5 sub-themes, including the first sub-themes *mufradat, hiwar, tarkib, qira'ah* and *kitabah* along with those according to their respective skills. At the end there is التدريبات لى الاستماع. The sorting of the material in this chapter is also arranged in order from easiest to hardest, for *qawa'id* it has started to vary, such as sentences determined by vocabulary, then changing property pronouns, question words such as , the use of question and answer sentences and change the sentences according to the *dhamir* written in the book.

Chapter III discusses about الأدوات المدرسية which consists of six sub-themes (*mufradat, hiwar, tarkib, qira'ah, kitabah* and *istima'*) and exercises according to each sub-theme. The vocabulary in this theme is quite easy, because there are still a lot of repeated vocabulary from chapter I and chapter II, the *qawa'id* aspect has started to enter the *mubtada' khabar*, and the material is arranged in order starting from the easiest to the most difficult.

Chapter IV discusses about الألوان which consists of six sub-themes (*mufradat, hiwar, tarkib, qira'ah, kitabah* and *istima'*) and exercises according to each sub-theme. This sub-theme also introduces a question model for asking colors using expressions; what color...? (ما لون...؟), various sentence structures about color discourse, and color differences for male and female types.

In the second semester. Chapter V discusses العنوان which consists of six sub-themes (*mufradat*, *hiwar*, *tarkib*, *qira'ah*, *kitabah* and *istima'*) and exercises according to each sub-theme. The material is in order from easiest to hardest. This chapter also explains about numbers (*al-'adad*) from 1 to 100 and introduces a question model for asking addresses with the question what address...? (ما عنوان...؟), and ask the amount with the question word how much ( $\lambda$ ).

Chapter VI discusses which consists of six sub-themes (*mufradat, hiwar, tarkib, qira'ah, kitabah* and *istima'*) and exercises according to each sub-theme. The order in this chapter is arranged from easy to difficult. The material in this chapter contains a lot of new vocabulary and also introduces *khabar muqaddam* and *mubtada muakhar* and the question model for asking what and whose object using the question word what or anything (ماذا), and whose (لمن). However, the vocabulary and *qawa'id* in the material are graded with the material that has been explained in the previous material.

Chapter VII deals with من يوميات الأسرة which consists of six sub-themes (*mufradat*, *hiwar*, *tarkib*, *qira'ah*, *kitabah* and *istima'*) and exercises according to each sub-theme. The order in this chapter is arranged from simple to complex, easiest to hardest and shortest to most complex. Many of the vocabulary in this chapter are taken from previous chapters, this chapter also introduces *fi'il mudhari'* and its changes and a question model to ask what are you doing using the sentence what are you doing? (ماذا تعمل؟).

### 3. Presentation

The presentation stage is a way of communicating material to language learners by showing what is in the pages of the book. Whether this presentation or presentation depends on the objectives and level of student learning Adinugraha, 2018). The presentation in this chapter is good, because in each chapter it is in accordance with four language skills. Which one starts with المفردات، الحوار، التركيب، القراءة، الكتابة، الاستماع والكلام.

According to Mackey, there are four aspects that need to be considered in this presentation process, namely differential procedures, ostensive procedures, pictorial procedures and context procedures (Ritonga, 2021). Judging from the material of chapters I to VII, the material has used these four aspects.

a) Differential procedures, this book is presented with meaningful interpretations and accompanied by pictures.

b) The ostensive procedure, this book does not apply the ostensive procedure, but the teacher can deliver the material with the help of the media.

c) Pictorial procedure, this pictorial procedure is very good because almost every *mufradat* has a picture to help students understand, as well as in *qira'ah*.

d) Context procedures, with this book the teacher can convey the material verbally (Shobirin et al., 2021).

# 4. Repetition

The repetition stage is a step taken so that the material presented can be accepted and internalized by language learners into ready-to-use language skills. Mackey divides the repetition material into four language skills that must be achieved, namely *istima'*, *kalam*, *qira'ah*, and *kitabah* (Setyawan et al., 2018). The sharpening technique used is a receptive and productive exercise. Receptive exercises are listening or listening and reading exercises, while productive exercises are speaking and writing exercises. Intensive speaking and writing practice is a form of language practice that is real.

Based on the results of the analysis that this book is designed according to the four *maharah* plus vocabulary, *hiwar*, and exercises to evaluate the level of students' abilities (Adinugraha et al., 2019). In this book, the techniques or steps taken so that the material presented can be digested and internalized by students, namely through productive and applicable exercises (Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha, 2017). This book is dominated by exercises (*tadribat*) equipped with very representative color illustrations to support students' language skills by paying attention to aspects of language elements and the four

language skills (Anas & Adinugraha, 2018). The more repetitions through the exercises you do, the more you train the fluency and memory of students (Hendri et al., 2017).

A. Analysis of the Strengths and Weaknesses of *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah*'s Book with BSNP Assessment Instruments

In determining the advantages and disadvantages of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book 2013 curriculum with the BSNP (National Education Standards Agency) assessment instrument which consists of four components of the feasibility of the book, namely content feasibility, presentation feasibility, linguistic feasibility and graphic feasibility (Fitriani & Saefulloh, 2018). The results of the analysis of this book show that there are quite a lot of advantages compared to the shortcomings of this book.

This book has many advantages for Arabic learners at MTs level and equivalent. But besides that, there are still some shortcomings, including:

1. In terms of content eligibility

a) All indicators in each material from semester I to semester II there are no changes except for the theme and sub-themes only

b) Use of inappropriate language rules, especially in the writing of letters. The researcher took one sample of the material المَكْتَبَةُ on the sentence تَلْكَ مَكْتَبَةُ المَدْرَسَةُ should be the word الأدوات المدرسيّة in that sentence is *mudhaf ilaihi* which should be *majrur* with *kharakat kasrah* because it is included in the *isim mufrad* so that it can cause differences in meaning and meaning and will also affect the understanding of students.

c) Some of the answer choices in the practice questions do not match the questions. In material بالعاملين في المدرسة errors in answers that do not match the question; بالعاملين في المدرسة the answer should be لَاَهَذَا فَصْلِي.

d) Practice questions that do not match the facts. In the material section الأدوات المدرسيّة, errors in questions that are not in accordance with the facts; من الْكَلِمَاتِ البَيْدَأَءَ مِنَ الْكَلِمَاتِ البُيّدَأَءَ مِنَ الْكَلِمَةِ المُلَوَّنَة, which contains the meaning of "arrange the following words starting from the colored word" while in the questions there are no colored verbs so that it will confuse students in working on.

e) Some practice questions or *istima'* questions in the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book for students, should practice questions or questions about *istima'* presented in the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book for teachers only as in the material المدرسة.

2. In terms of presentation feasibility

a) The presentation of the *Durusul Lughah* book is not equipped with an index, glossary and an Arabic-Latin transliteration list.

b) In presenting the material in all sub-themes *istima'* does not include audio CDs, all command words in practice questions only rely on the words of the teacher. The researcher took one example from the theme بالعاملين في المدرسة.

c) The presentation of all the material does not contain command words that indicate a scientific approach which includes observing, asking, trying, reasoning, and asking.

d) There are several presentations of evaluation material in this book that are not appropriate, the evaluation material is below after the change of *maharah* (skills), as in the material is below.

e) Partly there is no conversational material (*hiwar*), in the book explaining after the title *hiwar* immediately shows the exercise (*tadribat*), while the *hiwar* part is in the last training section as the researcher takes one of the examples of material on the theme العنوان.

3. In terms of language eligibility

a) The language in the command sentence that only uses Indonesian, does not use Arabic first, the question command should be made in Arabic and then underneath there is an Indonesian translation. Researchers take examples on the material التعريف بالنفس with the command word "Copy!".

b) There is a very short command sentence and only uses Arabic, the researcher takes an example from the material الأدوات المدرسية with command words "يصِلْ !"

4. In terms of the feasibility of graphics

a) The placement of the layout elements is not consistent, there is the wrong placement of the subtheme of the material and the label of the exercise, some are not given subtitles and some are wrongly numbered the word elements. Researchers take examples on the material الأدوات المدرسية.

b) In the book there is no white space including margins that provide balance with the text, and illustrations so that they give the impression of being dense (saturated).

# Conclusion

The results of the analysis carried out by the researchers on the book *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* 2013 curriculum class VII published by the Ministry of Religion is appropriate to be used as a handbook in learning Arabic for students of Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs), especially class VII. The following conclusions can be drawn from the two problem formulations as proposed by the researcher: The content analysis of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book based on Mackey's perspective has been in accordance with four aspects, namely selection, gradation, presentation and repetition. The advantages of the *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book with the BSNP (National Education Standards Agency) assessment instrument include; lies in the depth and breadth of the material, while the shortcomings of this *Durusul Lughah al-Arabiyah* book lie in the same indicators in all themes, the giving of harakat is not correct, the choice of answers in practice questions does not match the question, does not provide an index, glossary, and Arabic-transliteration list. Latin, does not include an audio CD on the special sub-theme in the textbook, the presentation of the evaluation material in this book is not appropriate

# References

- Adinugraha, H H, Ulama'i, A. H. A., & ... (2019). Word Interpretation of "Sīrū" in Alquran and Its Relevance with Halal Tourism. *RELIGIA*.
- Adinugraha, Hendri Hermawan. (2017). Simbolisasi Dan Ikonisasi: Metode Alternatif Memahami Arabic Terms Pada Produk Perbankan Syariah. 5(January), 67–86.
- Adinugraha, Hendri Hermawan. (2018). Yaumiddin Dalam Perspektif Teori Hermeneutika Emilio Betti. *RELIGIA*. https://doi.org/10.28918/religia.v20i2.818
- Anas, A., & Adinugraha, H. H. (2018). Gerakan Dakwah Tarekat Qodiriyah wa Naqsyabandiyah di Grobogan. *Jurnal Komunikasi Islam*, 1(1). https://doi.org/10.15642/jki.2018.1.1.179-211
- Anggota Kemenetrian Agama. (2014). *Buku Siswa Bahasa Arab Pendekatan Saintifik Kurikulum 2013*. Kementerian Agama RI.
- Baroroh, R. U., & Tsani, E. R. (2019). Evaluasi Mahārah Al-Qirā'ah Dalam Buku Ajar Durūs Al-Lugah Al-'Arabiyyah Buku Siswa Bahasa Arab Pendekatan Saintifik Kurikulum 2013 Kelas X Madrasah Aliyah. *Al Mahāra: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab, 5*(1). https://doi.org/10.14421/almahara.2019.051-06
- Ceccherini-Silberstein, T., Scarabotti, F., & Tolli, F. (2015). Mackey's theory of τ-conjugate representations for finite groups. *Japanese Journal of Mathematics*, *10*(1). https://doi.org/10.1007/s11537-014-1390-8
- Fitriani, N., & Saefulloh, H. (2018). Analisis Bahan Ajar "Buku Siswa Bahasa Arab" Untuk Kelas 6 Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (Pendekatan Saintifik 2013). *EL-IBTIKAR: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab, 7*(2). https://doi.org/10.24235/ibtikar.v7i2.3336
- Ghani, K. A., Noh, A. S., & Bukhari, N. I. A. (2021). Linguistic Features Differences in Arabic Textbooks Used at Islamic Schools in Malaysia. *Kemanusiaan*, *28*(1). https://doi.org/10.21315/KAJH2021.28.1.7
- Hendri, O., Adinugraha, H., & Astuti, S. D. (2017). Emotikonik Islami : Menuju Branding Produk Halal (Suatu Agenda Penelitian ). FSH UNSIQ PROCEEDING SERIES: On Islamic Studies, Sharia and Law Vol. 1, Desember 2017: 125-152; e-ISSN: 2614-2821, 125–152.
- Izzuddin, Dalimunthe, R. P., & Susilo, S. (2021). The Portrayal of Women in Arabic Textbooks for Non-Arabic Speakers. *SAGE Open*, *11*(2). https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211014184
- Kaba, A., & Abdullah, A. D. (2020). Investigating Students' Attitudes Toward Arabic and English Textbooks in Communication and Media. *SAGE Open*, *10*(3). https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020949208
- Language teaching. (2007). Language Teaching, 40(2). https://doi.org/10.1017/s0261444807214284
- تعليم اللغة العربية من خلال كتاب دروس اللغة العربية لإمام زركشي و إمام شباني بالمدرسة .(2018) Maimunah, M., & Irfandi, A. الثانوية العامة النور تيبينج سولوه اوكان كوميريع ايلير. (01). https://doi.org/10.24042/albayan.v10i01.2601
- Moser, J. (2021). Evaluating Arabic textbooks: A corpus-based lexical frequency study. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics (United Kingdom)*, *31*(2). https://doi.org/10.1111/ijal.12321

- Ritonga, A. W. (2021). Analysis of Arabic Textbook "Takallam Bil 'Arabiyyah Volume 6" Based on Mickey's Theory. *Tanwir Arabiyyah: Arabic As Foreign Language Journal*, 1(1). https://doi.org/10.31869/aflj.v1i1.2534
- Rosenberg, J. (1994). *C\*-algebras and Mackey's theory of group representations*. https://doi.org/10.1090/conm/167/1292014
- Sa'adiyah, H., & Saputra, I. (2018). تحليل محتوى كتاب دروس اللغة العربية الجزء الأول للإمام الزركشي والإمام الشباني من Sa'adiyah, H., & Saputra, I. (2018). التراكيب وأثرها في فهم النصوص الإسلامية. ISLAM TRANSFORMATIF : Journal of Islamic Studies, 2(1). https://doi.org/10.30983/it.v2i1.736
- Salam, M. Y. (2008). Durûs Al-Lughah Al-'Arabiyyah Karya Mahmud Yunus Dalam Perspektif Nazariyyah Al-Wahdah. *Ta'dib*, 11(2). https://doi.org/10.31958/jt.v11i2.144
- Setyawan, C. E., Basit, L. A., & Fathoni, M. (2018). Telaah Bahan Ajar Bahasa Arab "Ayo Fasih Berbahasa Arab" Madrasah Aliyah Kelas XII Karya Hasan Saefullah (Tinjauan Materi Berdasarkan Teori Mackey). *Prosiding Konferensi Nasional Bahasa Arab IV*.
- Shobirin, A., Wargadinata, W., & Hasan, N. (2021). The Production of Supplementary Learning Materials of Arabic Grammatology Based on The Curriculum 2013 with Scientific Approach at The First State Islamic Senior High School Malang. *Asalibuna*, 4(2). https://doi.org/10.30762/asa.v4i2.2475
- Shodiq, M. J. (2014). Bias Gender dalam Buku Bahasa Arab Siswa MA Kelas X dengan Pendekatan Saintifik 2013. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 3*(2). https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2014.32.307-326
- Ubaid, A. (2020). تقويم كتاب "دروس اللغة العربية" للأستاذ إمام زركشي والأستاذ إمام شباني .*Lugawiyyat, 2*(1). https://doi.org/10.18860/lg.v2i1.10829